

FIRST INTERMEDIATE CONGRESS—PREMIER CONGRÈS INTERMÉDIAIRE
THE IMPACT OF UNIFORM LAW ON NATIONAL LAWS, LIMITS AND POSSIBILITIES
L'INCIDENCE DU DROIT UNIFORME SUR LE DROIT NATIONAL. LIMITES ET POSSIBILITÉS

FEDERALISM AND LEGAL UNIFICATION:
A COMPARATIVE EMPIRICAL
INVESTIGATION OF TWENTY SYSTEMS

DANIEL HALBERSTAM
MATHIAS REIMANN
JORGE A. SÁNCHEZ CÓRDERO

Editors / Editores



International Academy of
Comparative Law



Federalism and Legal Unification:
A Comparative Empirical Investigation of Twenty Systems

INSTITUTO DE INVESTIGACIONES JURÍDICAS
Serie, DOCTRINA JURÍDICA Núm. 620

Coordinadora editorial: Elvia Lucía Flores Ávalos
Asistente editorial: Karla Beatriz Templos Núñez
Edición y formación en computadora: Gilda Bautista Ravelo
Diseño de portada: Edith Aguilar Gálvez

First Intermediate Congress – Premier Congrès Intermédiaire
The Impact of Uniform Law on National Laws. Limits and Possibilities
L'incidence du Droit Uniforme sur le Droit National. Limites et Possibilités

FEDERALISM AND LEGAL UNIFICATION:
A COMPARATIVE EMPIRICAL
INVESTIGATION OF TWENTY SYSTEMS

Daniel HALBERSTAM
Mathias REIMANN
and
Jorge A. SÁNCHEZ CORDERO
Editors



International Academy of
Comparative Law



INTERNATIONAL ACADEMY OF COMPARATIVE LAW
UNIVERSIDAD NACIONAL AUTÓNOMA DE MÉXICO
CENTRO MEXICANO DE DERECHO UNIFORME

PARIS AND MEXICO, 2012

First Edition - Primera edición: March 1, 2012

DR © 2012, International Academy of Comparative Law, Paris, France,
and Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México
Ciudad Universitaria, 04510 México, D. F.

INTERNATIONAL ACADEMY OF COMPARATIVE LAW

20 Rue St.-Guillaume

75007 Paris

France

and

INSTITUTO DE INVESTIGACIONES JURÍDICAS

Circuito Maestro Mario de la Cueva s/n
Ciudad de la Investigación en Humanidades
Ciudad Universitaria, 04510 México, D. F.

Impreso y hecho en México – Printed in Mexico

ISBN 978-607-02-2804-9

CONTENTS

Preface	xi
---------------	----

PART ONE GENERAL REPORT

Federalism and Legal Unification: A Comparative Empirical Investigation of Twenty Systems

Daniel HALBERSTAM
Mathias REIMANN

I. Introduction	1
1. The Need for this Study	1
2. Federalism Defined	1
3. Database and Method	2
4. Three Caveats	3
5. The Structure of this General Report	4
II. Modes of Legal Unification	4
1. Top-Down Unification: Central Government Power	4
2. Coordinate Unification: Cooperation among the Member Units	10
3. Unification through Non-State Actors	13
4. Legal Education and Legal Practice	15
5. The Impact of International Law	17
6. Summary and Evaluation	20
III. Levels of Legal Unification	20
1. Uniformity by Areas of Law	21
2. The Uniformity by Federal System	23
IV. Explaining Unification	
1. The Legislative Power Hypothesis	24
2. Structural Centralization Hypothesis	30
3. The Legal Traditions Hypothesis: Civil v. Common Law	30
4. Political Parties	34
5. Territorially Bounded Cleavages	34
6. The Age of Federations	35
V. Conclusion	36
Appendix 1: Methods	39
Appendix 2: National Reporter Questionnaire and Scorecard	41
Appendix 3: Supplemental Scorecard Questions	51

CONTENTS

PART TWO
NATIONAL REPORTS

Argentina	55
Alfredo VÍTOLO	
Australia.....	66
Cheryl SAUNDERS	
Michelle FOSTER	
Austria.....	77
Bernhard KOCH	
Anna GAMPER	
Belgium.....	90
Alain-Laurent VERBEKE	
Brazil.....	111
Jacob DOLINGER	
Luis Roberto BARROSO	
Canada	123
Aline GRENON	
European Union	141
Jan WOUTERS	
Hanne CUYCKENS	
Thomas RAMOPOULOS	
Germany.....	171
Jürgen ADAM	
Christoph MÖLLERS	
India	184
Sunita PARIKH	
Italy	190
Louis DEL DUCA	
Patrick DEL DUCA	
Malaysia.....	210
Ang Hean LENG	
Amanda WHITING	
Mexico	241
Oscar QUINTANA	
Nadja DOROTHEA RUIZ EULER	
Ricardo CARRASCO VARONA	
Netherlands	253
Arjen VAN RIJN	

CONTENTS

Russian Federation.....	257
Jeffrey KAHN	
Alexei TROCHEV	
Nikolay BALAYAN	
South Africa.....	283
Karthi GOVENDER	
Spain.....	301
Aida TORRES PÉREZ	
Switzerland.....	316
Eleanor CASHIN RITAINE	
Anne-SOPHIE PAPEIL	
United Kingdom.....	333
Stathis BANAKAS	
United States.....	354
James MAXEINER	
Venezuela.....	378
Allan R. BREWER-CARÍAS	
Jan KLEINHEISTERKAMP	
Contributors.....	392

Federalism and Legal Unification Comparing Methods, Results, and Explanations across Twenty Systems, editado por el Instituto de Investigaciones Jurídicas de la UNAM, se terminó de imprimir el 1o. de marzo de 2012 en los talleres de Editorial Formación Gráfica, S. A. de C. V., Matamoros 112, col. Raúl Romero, Ciudad Nezahualcóyotl, 57630 Estado de México. Se utilizó tipo *Baskerville* de 9, 10 y 11 puntos. En esta edición se empleó papel cultural ahuesado 13.5 x 21 de 37 kilos para los interiores y cartulina couché de 154 kilos para los forros; consta de 500 ejemplares (impresión *offset*).